

Yevgen Khrykov EUROPEAN, NATIONAL, AND INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS OF QUALITY MANAGEMENT AND ITS DEVELOPMENT IN HIGHER EDUCATION IN UKRAINE// Education and Pedagogical Sciences. – 2012. - №1. C. 13-21.

Yevgen Khrykov

EUROPEAN, NATIONAL, AND INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS OF  
QUALITY MANAGEMENT AND ITS DEVELOPMENT IN HIGHER  
EDUCATION IN UKRAINE

Quality assurance is one of the action lines of the European higher education area which is launched to ensure attractiveness, trust, mobility, student motivation, and bridges in the European higher education.

There is no universal quality assurance system in Europe; however, some general approaches have been developed and accepted by most of the specialists. The academic community considers that the following things are of special importance for quality assurance:

- initial training of the University students;
- correlation of the academic programmes and tasks of education;
- high qualification of teachers and other staff;
- educational environment and resources to implement the academic programmes of the higher educational institution (HEI) and fulfill the tasks of education;
- teaching organized according to modern trends of national and international economy and education; and
- compliance of graduates with objectives of education.

Some experts and quality assurance agencies recommend taking the following into consideration:

- autonomy in programmes' implementation;
- effectiveness of education;

- effectiveness of quality assurance;
- intellectual property;
- openness for external recommendations;
- professional experience;
- financial security.

There are external and internal mechanisms of institutional quality assurance in the European countries, with the external quality assurance becoming more popular.

The English, German, and French models represent the traditional quality assurance models in Europe. The British model centres on academic self-assurance. There is a multilevel accreditation system in Great Britain which deals with the Universities and their programmes at the aegis of the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA). Some higher educational institutions perform mutual evaluation of the academic programmes using the criteria suggested by the QAA. The Open University (OU), in its turn, founded the Open University Validation Services (OUVS) in 1992 to accredit foreign educational institutions and their programmes. Internationalisation of education and appearance of different educational levels led to foundation of certain accreditation bodies in Germany. Ministerial meeting in 1998 marked the creation of the Accreditation Council for Master's and Bachelor's programmes evaluation. This Council prepared general standards and criteria for the accreditation agencies. In present, the Accreditation Agency for Study Programs in Engineering, Informatics, Natural Sciences, and Mathematics (ASIIN) evaluates academic programmes in Technologies, Informatics, Natural Sciences and Mathematics, as well as other agencies that specialize in a variety of subjects. The French model accents external evaluation and focuses mostly on higher education institution responsiveness to society.

Analysis indicates that in Europe there is no universal system of the institutional performance assessment of HEIs, which would be similar to the US Accreditation system. Nevertheless, the European Network of Quality Assurance (ENQA) in higher education was created in 2000.

The above mentioned characteristics determine the European dimension of quality assurance for Ukraine. In order to clarify the nature of its influence on Ukrainian higher education, we will analyse the national and institutional dimensions.

The national dimension of quality assurance is comprised of state mechanisms and social situation, which has a considerable impact on higher education functioning and development.

A high level of centralization is inherent in Ukrainian system of higher education. That is why state mechanisms and means determine professional education in certain fields. These mechanisms consist of law making, elaboration of legally enforceable enactments and state programmes of educational development, licensing procedures, accreditation, standards development, state support for research development, education and advanced training of faculty members, educational institutions financing, promotion of educational and research publications, periodicals, development of information technologies and libraries. Nowadays the state defines even the technology of academic process organization, which is universal for all higher educational institutions.

The state higher education management in Ukraine is characterized by the following features:

- *Institutionalization of licensing and accreditation procedures, the spread of their corrupt practices.* The accreditation agencies for higher educational institutions are not found in Ukraine, and accreditation is carried out by university faculty members, who are not properly trained or motivated.
- *Absence of effective quality control system for higher educational institutions.* This control is confined to annual report analysis, which is submitted by higher educational institutions to the Ministry of Education and Science.
- *Insufficient financing of higher educational institutions.* The government of the country finances faculty's salary, scholarships for budget students and

post-graduate students, and universities' utilities. The maintenance and development of universities' resource base is not provided by the state.

- *Effective mechanisms for regulating the quantity of higher educational institutions are absent.* As a result, the number of such institutions exceeds country's quotas. It makes adequate financing of higher educational institutions impossible and creates the situation when universities enroll all students applying to study there without any selection. For these reasons, the level of such students does not comply with the requirements of high-quality education.
- *Weak connection of the list of specialities and licensed quotas with the labour market.* This situation is determined by the lack of stable connection between higher education and business, the centralized character of educational management, inadequate development of market mechanisms for higher education regulation.
- *The archaic mechanisms of forming rector's corpus and organizing administrators' activities at higher educational institutions.* It creates the situation when the university's administrative position can be taken by someone who does not comply with the contemporary requirements. If we take into consideration that the university administrator is not accountable to his or her personnel and can take decisions individually, then the faculty members of higher educational institutions align themselves not with the quality of education, but with the administrator and his or her directions. The exceeding role of the subjective factor for the university administrators, particularly their centralized power, unlimited term of service, lack of effective evaluation and control system have a great effect on the quality assurance mechanisms. The individual power of the administrator becomes of paramount importance, but it can be subjective by nature and either secure quality assurance system or fail to do so. However, the nature of the quality assurance problem cannot condition employment of autocratic methods.

The impact of the social situation on quality assurance can be negative to a considerable degree. It can be characterized by the following:

- A higher education diploma does not always provide a graduate with the corresponding position in a professional domain. Even if the graduate is offered such a position, not everyone is willing to take it, which is due to low salary levels or difficulties connected with moving to a new place of living.
- Public opinion that supports quality education is underdeveloped.
- The majority of population is oriented towards getting a diploma versus obtaining quality education.
- The practice of ordering and buying term papers, diploma papers, master's papers, as well as doctorate level dissertations is widely spread and accepted by the public opinion.
- Traditions of sponsorship in higher education are not formed.
- The population has low income, which is conditioned by the state of Ukrainian economy.

It is possible to evaluate the influence of state mechanisms on the development of higher education in Ukraine under conditions that the former are compared against peculiarities of the major groups of inner factors of quality assurance in higher educational institutions. To these groups we refer the most typical peculiarities of the academic process, students, teachers, and management of the Ukrainian higher educational institutions.

The academic process in the Ukrainian higher educational institutions is characterized by the following features:

- *Orientation of the majority of higher educational institutions towards admitting anyone willing to be enrolled as a student without considering their level of training.* This peculiarity is conditioned by the low level of financing of higher educational establishments and the low level of tuition fees.
- *Absence of diversity in educational contents and individual student plans.* For their implementation the higher educational establishments lack financial

resources, academic premises, as well as experience in organizing the academic process in the new conditions.

➤ *Detachment of educational contents from international standards in the majority of specialities.* This can be explained by the low level of autonomy of the Ukrainian HEIs, which are to take national standards as their guidelines, absence of cooperation with HEIs from foreign countries, as well as limited participation in international projects on development of educational programmes/curricula.

➤ *Organization of the academic process according to the yearly and group principle of distributing students, which makes it impossible to individualize the former.* Preservation of the Soviet principle of organization of the academic process is determined not only by traditions, but also by underestimation of the original value of each individual.

➤ *Poor connection of the academic process with business and industry.* There are several reasons for that. Absence of traditions of having such connections and their established forms. Absence of interest in having such connections from the side of businesses as the system of training specialists by order of certain companies does not exist. Optionality of having such connections for HEIs.

➤ *Isolation of the academic process from science.* This situation is conditioned by the predominant in Ukraine system of determining teachers' workload, absence of scientific departments in the majority of the Ukrainian HEIs, structure of curricula, absence of the equipment necessary for scientific research.

➤ *Cribbing/plagiarism when testing the results of the students' academic activities.* Public opinion of students and position of the academic staff support this situation.

➤ *Absence of the system of objective evaluation of results of the students' academic activities, influence of corruption schemes on the evaluation process,*

*prevalence of principle "the one who teaches, tests the quality of mastering the learning course".*

➤ *Discrepancy between available material resources of the academic process and its tasks.* This is due to the insufficient state financing of HEIs, limited resources of the HEIs, policy of the governance of HEIs, reluctance of business representatives to take part in the development of the material infrastructure of HEIs.

Students of the Ukrainian higher educational establishments are characterized as follows:

➤ *Low level of learning motivation with major part of students.* This level is conditioned by numerous factors – individual peculiarities of future students, a possibility to get a degree without learning hard, students' social opinion which does not support conscientious attitude, absence of guarantees of getting a job after graduation, low level of salaries of higher educational establishments' graduates.

➤ *Absence of unfavourable attitude to cheating, plagiarism, corrupt ways of getting marks.* The main part in this plays the condition of social ethics, unpretentiousness of higher educational establishments' personnel, absence of the technologies of the academic process which make these negative phenomena impossible.

➤ *Absence of clear professional interests with future and present students.* This situation is determined by the condition of the economic situation in the country, the attitude of modern youth to higher education, the system of their life priorities, imperfectness of profession oriented activities.

➤ *Non-correspondence of major part of those entering an educational establishment to the demands of the learning process, absence of the necessary learning abilities and lack of the basic knowledge.*

➤ *Poor knowledge of foreign languages, which makes participation in international grants and international mobility impossible.* This is determined by the entering level of a foreign language, its learning condition in a higher

educational establishment, lack of situations in which students could use their knowledge of a foreign language – lectures in foreign language, communication with foreigners, participation in international grants and mobility within the Bologna process.

Teachers of Ukrainian higher educational establishments can be characterized as follows:

- a large amount of auditorium classes which is determined by the Law of Higher Education, different approaches of higher educational establishments to assigning the teaching load, financial possibilities and financial policy of educational establishments;
- low salaries, the amount of which is conditioned by the level of financing of a higher educational establishment by the country, low payment of teaching contract students, financial priorities of educational establishments;
- poor knowledge of foreign languages which makes participation in international grants and international mobility impossible. Most higher educational establishments do not consider knowledge of a foreign language as a necessary requirement while applying for a job and continuing teachers' contracts, the number of foreign language courses is low;
- lack of teaching experience in higher educational establishments of other countries, which is connected with poor international relations of Ukrainian higher educational establishments, lack of compatibility, correspondence of the education content, poor language grounding of Ukrainian teachers;
- formalization of research activity which is connected with teaching overload and lack of necessary personal qualities with the majority of teachers.

Administration of Ukrainian higher educational establishments is characterized by:

- the absence of professional managers within the governing body on all levels;



- centralization of university management, which causes concentration of all the power with rectors and removal of mid-level leaders and teachers from taking administrative decisions;
- non-independence of structural subdivisions, absence of a real autonomy;
- limitedness of rights of corporate organs – scientific council, committees, which is conditioned by the demonstrative/formal character of their work;
- underdevelopment of the majority of administrative processes, which produces manual mode of management;
- absence of the evaluation system of heads on all levels;
- supremacy of the tradition to hold leading posts on all levels of a higher educational establishment for an unlimited period of time;
- orientation of the university management toward solving financial problems, but not the quality of education;
- incompleteness of the system of selection, evaluation, promotion, development of administrative and teaching personnel;
- lobbyism of taking important administrative decisions.

Introduction of the quality system model stipulated by the international ISO 9000 series standards can be mentioned as one of the urgent means of overcoming most of the listed institutional imperfections, especially in relation to Ukraine. The first higher educational institutions, the quality systems of which were certificated according to the international standard, have already appeared in Ukraine, as well as educational institutions that create such systems but do not head for their certification. The importance of introducing ISO standards for Ukraine is conditioned by the fact that their corresponding quality system allows decreasing the influence of the negative higher education institutional factors owing to better implementation of organizational tasks, increase of the normative regulation role in a higher educational institution's work, and decrease of the manual management role.

The experience of creating the quality assurance system according to the ISO 9000 series standards at the Institute of Continuing Education of Luhansk National University shows that such system provides:

- a better implementation of the organization tasks;
- transformation of most 'unique' managerial situations, which require personal participation of top administrators, a considerable waste of time to the range of 'standard', which have ready solution procedures;
- enhancement of the organizational culture of a higher educational institution;
- development of personnel owing to the formation of modern views on managerial work and new competences;
- time saving on organizational problems' solution once the main components of the QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM have been formed;
- improvement of microclimate in the organization owing to the organizational culture level enhancement;
- a higher level of customer satisfaction with educational and other services provided by a higher educational institution;
- improvement of a higher educational institution's image;
- democratization of higher educational institution management owing to the fact that the developed procedures of collective work and not the personal power of a top administrator come to the foreground;
- a higher level of validity of managerial decisions;
- a systematic approach used in solving managerial problems of the higher educational institution;
- an increase of legal validity level of HEI management due to the fact that the majority of managerial tasks are decided on the grounds of the ratified activity procedures;
- an increase of level of purposefulness of HEI activity owing to the elaborated procedures of monitoring, analysis, and decision-making;

- introduction of the QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM conditions strengthening of decentralization of management processes at HEIs since the necessity to take the majority of the managerial decisions on the 'top level' , that is by the top administration of HEI, disappears;
- introduction of the QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM conditions the process of delegation of certain managerial functions from the top administrators to other employees;
- introduction of the QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM conditions the increase of transparency level of HEI management. It means that the majority of managerial processes are described and their procedures are well known to the employees;
- creation of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM promotes formation of a more effective system of assessment and motivation of employees' activity. This effect is related to direct and indirect mechanisms of realization of this feature that QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM has. The direct mechanisms are related to the fact that QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM presupposes the development of assessment and motivation processes of employees' activity. The indirect mechanisms are related to the fact that QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM presupposes modeling numerous aspects of employees' activity in the form of job requirements, instructions, and methodological recommendations. These documents simplify assessment of employees' activity and perform the motivational function;
- the documents elaborated in the process of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM creation perform the function of activity orientation basis, which facilitates employees' work and increases its efficiency;
- realization of tasks of creating QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM enhances the efficiency of the process of development, improvement of employees' qualifications and self-education. It is related to the fact that requirements to activity contents, knowledge, and skills of employees become more precise. Such situation provides a better connection between

the improvement of employees' qualifications and self-development and the objectives of HEIs, on the one hand, and contents of employees' activity, on the other hand;

- introduction of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM conditions the reduction of conflict situations and psychological barriers in the relations of employees. It is related to the fact that the greater part of contents of administrative employees' activity is oriented not towards their top management orders, but to the elaborated and ratified activity procedures;
- introduction of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM conditions the fundamental change in contents of activity of those HEI employees' who are involved in organizational activity. According to a traditional situation, the contents of such an employee's activity are determined by positional responsibilities, subjective attitudes of top administration and other employees, and current work situations. Under conditions of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM operation, the contents of employees' activity is determined by actual managerial tasks, tested by international experience, the completion of which considerably diminishes appearance and influence of current situations on management efficiency;
- introduction of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM conditions decrease of possible negative influence of a human factor on employees' management efficiency. Under traditional conditions, the efficiency of organizational activity mostly depends on knowledge, skills, and subjective attitudes of employees. Under conditions of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM operation, the leading role in providing the efficiency of management is played not by the subjective factors, but by the elaborated activity procedures;
- creation of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM signifies transition to the new philosophy and the new HEI management paradigm, which is characterized by modern conceptions of aim, content, means, principles, regularities and results of the management activity. Philosophy of the

QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM corresponds to the basic vector of the general civilization development;

- introduction of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM increases the role and influence of independent employees on the goal achievement of a higher educational institution. In modern conditions, HEIs are significant social systems in terms of their dimensions; therefore hierarchical relations and centralized formations are not able to provide effective functioning. Horizontal relations, but not hierarchical, play the main role under QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM. The broadening of employees' powers owing to decentralization as well as delegation of powers stimulates the increase of self-evaluation and degree of responsibility for common results of the activity. Attainment of independence and responsibility provides the proper behaviour of the employees, which is now to a larger extent based on a personal position and elaborated processes versus the instructions of their administration;
- an important peculiarity of QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM is its constant improvement and development. This corresponds to the tendencies of the modern society development, when, as V.G.Kremen says, “we have entered the period, when change of ideas, technologies and knowledge happens more quickly than changing of the generations...” (Kremen, 2007)

The given characteristics of the European, national, and institutional dimensions of the higher education quality management allows making certain conclusions. The question of creating the quality assurance system is both complicated and complex, and requires an integrated solution. Experience in quality management accumulated in Europe is an example for Ukraine to follow; however, mechanic transference of this experience onto Ukrainian grounds can fail to yield the expected results. This is due to the fact that higher education in European countries has undergone a long historic way and can be characterized by a number of features, which make up the basis of the modern system. These

features are natural for the European higher education; therefore, they may not be even regarded as compulsory conditions for quality assurance. However, these conditions are very important for Ukraine: democratic traditions of higher education organization, approaches to the organization of academicians' activities (appointment procedure, standardization of teaching and research structure, arrangement of working conditions, teacher's performance assessment, remuneration system), individualization of academic activity, techniques for promoting higher education and community cooperation, techniques for solving managerial tasks, etc. For this reason, creation of the quality assurance system in higher education of Ukraine is impossible without finding solutions to these issues.

The second group of such problems includes those connected with neutralization of the aforementioned negative peculiarities of the Ukrainian higher education. Since the strategy of creating the quality assurance system cannot be based only on fighting the negative manifestations, the third group is comprised of the tasks connected with development of positive qualities and introduction of the innovative quality assurance technologies.

Creation of the quality assurance system presupposes determining not only problem structure, but also ways of finding solutions to them. The most important means include modernization of the regulatory framework of Ukraine, which would allow implementing the necessary reforms in higher education; creation of the agencies, which would assess the performance of higher educational establishments; implementation of ISO 9000 series standards, which would help to solve current problems; substantial versus formal implementation of the Bologna reforms; employment of the European experience in the field of quality assurance.

#### Abstracts

The article provides analysis of three dimensions of the quality assurance system – European, national (Ukrainian), and institutional. Due to the fact that there is no universal quality assurance system in the European

countries, the article depicts its most important features for the modern stage of development of Ukraine. The national dimension of the quality assurance system is comprised of the state management mechanisms and the peculiarities of the social situation in Ukraine.

The peculiarities of students, academicians, organization of the academic process, and management of educational establishments comprise the institutional dimension. These peculiarities negatively influence the performance quality of higher educational institutions to a large extent.

The article suggests logic of creating the quality assurance system in Ukraine, which lies in the following:

- negotiation of negative and development of positive factors of the higher education in the country;
- formation of features characteristic of the European higher education;
- introduction of modern European experience in the field of quality assurance.

Modernization of the regulatory framework, creation of the HEIs performance assessment agencies, implementation of ISO 9000 series standards for finding solutions to the current problems, substantial versus formal introduction of the Bologna reforms are suggested as means for realization of the aforementioned tasks.

#### Анотація

У статті наведено аналіз трьох контекстів системи гарантії якості – європейського, національного - українського, інституційного. У зв'язку з тим, що в Європейських країнах не існує загальноприйнятої системи гарантії якості, то наводяться найбільш важливі для сучасного етапу розвитку України її властивості. Національний контекст системи гарантії якості для України складають державні механізми управління та особливості соціальної ситуації в країні.

Інституційний контекст складають особливості студентів, викладачів, організації навчального процесу, управління навчальними закладами. Ці особливості значною мірою негативно впливають на якість діяльності ВНЗ.

У статті пропонується логіка створення системи гарантії якості в Україні, яка полягає у наступному:

- подолання негативних та розвиток позитивних чинників вищої освіти країни;
- формування властивостей, притаманних вищій освіті Європи;
- запровадження сучасного європейського досвіду гарантій якості.

У якості засобів реалізації цих завдань запропонована модернізація законодавчої бази, створення агенцій оцінки діяльності ВНЗ, реалізація для вирішення накопичених проблем ідей стандартів ISO серії 9000, змістовне а не формальне запровадження Болонських реформ.

#### Анотація

В статье приведен анализ трех контекстов системы гарантии качества – европейского, национального - украинского, институционального. В связи с тем, что в Европейских странах не существует общепринятой системы гарантии качества, то приводятся наиболее важные для современного этапа развития Украины ее особенности. Национальный контекст системы гарантии качества для Украины составляют государственные механизмы управления и особенности социальной ситуации в стране.

Институциональный контекст составляют особенности студентов, преподавателей, организации учебного процесса, управления учебными заведениями. Эти особенности в значительной степени негативно влияют на качество деятельности ВУЗ.

В статье предлагается логика создания системы гарантии качества в Украине, которая состоит в следующем:



- преодоление негативных и развитие позитивных факторов высшего образования страны;
- формирование особенностей, присущих высшему образованию Европы;
- внедрение современного европейского опыта гарантии качества.

В качестве способов реализации этих задач предложена модернизация законодательной базы, создание агентств оценки деятельности ВУЗ, реализация для решения наколенных проблем идей стандартов ISO серии 9000, содержательное а не формальное проведение Болонских реформ.

#### References

В.Г.Кремень, С.М.Пазиніч, О.С.Пономарьов Філософія управління: Піручник для студ. вищ.навч. закл. К. Знання України. – 2007. – 360 с.

The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA). – спосіб доступу: [www.qaa.ac.uk](http://www.qaa.ac.uk)

The European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education. – спосіб доступу: [www.enqa.eu](http://www.enqa.eu)

[http://www.asiin.de/english/newdesign/index\\_ex5.html](http://www.asiin.de/english/newdesign/index_ex5.html)